# AGS **APPLIED** MATERIALS **NINTERFACES**

# High-Performance Asymmetric Supercapacitor Based on Graphene Hydrogel and Nanostructured  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$

Hongcai Gao, Fei Xiao, Chi Bun Ching, and Hongwei Duan[\\*](#page-8-0)

School of Chemical and Biomedical Engineering, Nanyang Technological University, 70 Nanyang Drive, Singapore 637457

# **S** [Supporting Information](#page-8-0)

ABSTRACT: We have successfully fabricated an asymmetric supercapacitor with high energy and power densities using graphene hydrogel (GH) with 3D interconnected pores as the negative electrode and vertically aligned  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates on nickel foam  $(MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF)$  as the positive electrode in a neutral aqueous  $Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$  electrolyte. Because of the desirable porous structure, high specific capacitance and rate capability of GH and  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$ , complementary potential window of the two electrodes, and the elimination of polymer binders and conducting additives, the asymmetric supercapacitor can be cycled reversibly in a wide potential window of 0−2.0 V and exhibits an energy density



of 23.2 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup> with a power density of 1.0 kW kg<sup>-1</sup>. Energy density of the asymmetric supercapacitor is significantly improved in comparison with those of symmetric supercapacitors based on GH (5.5 Wh kg<sup>−1</sup>) and  $MnO_2$ -NF (6.7 Wh kg<sup>−1</sup>). Even at a high power density of 10.0 kW kg<sup>−1</sup>, the asymmetric supercapacitor can deliver a high energy density of 14.9 Wh kg<sup>−1</sup>. The asymmetric supercapacitor also presents stable cycling performance with 83.4% capacitance retention after 5000 cycles.

KEYWORDS: graphene hydrogel, manganese oxide nanoplates, cathodic electrodeposition, asymmetric supercapacitor, energy storage

# 1. INTRODUCTION

Supercapacitors represent an emerging class of energy storage devices that have attracted increasing attention because of a number of important features including high power density, fast charging/discharging rate, and excellent cycle stability.[1](#page-8-0)−[3](#page-8-0) Such outstanding properties make them promising in a wide range of applications from hybrid vehicles and portable electronics to military devices, where high power density and long cycle-life are highly desirable. However, the low energy density (normally less than 10 Wh  $\rm kg^{-1})$  of commercially available supercapacitors has imposed significant challenges in employing them as primary power sources to replace batteries.<sup>[4](#page-8-0)</sup> Recently, concentrated efforts have been made to tackle this problem by developing nanostructured electrode materials with improved specific capacitance and increasing the operating voltage of a supercapacitor.<sup>[5](#page-8-0)−[7](#page-8-0)</sup> In particular, two strategies are commonly explored for the design of high-voltage supercapacitors, i.e., replacing aqueous electrolytes with organic electrolytes<sup>[8](#page-8-0),[9](#page-8-0)</sup> or ionic liquids<sup>[10,11](#page-8-0)</sup> having wider potential windows and developing hybrid (asymmetric) supercapacitors with both capacitive electrode as power source and Faradic electrode as energy source.<sup>[12](#page-8-0)−[14](#page-8-0)</sup> However, nonaqueous electrolytes typically suffer from limited ionic conductivity and also raise safety concerns about the potential environmental impact in case of leakage. On the other hand, the construction of asymmetric supercapacitors is an effective approach to extend the cell potential window of aqueous electrolytes beyond the thermodynamic limit of ∼1.2 V and thus significantly improve the energy density.<sup>[15](#page-8-0)−[18](#page-8-0)</sup> The combination of appropriate

electrode materials working in well-separated potential windows in the same electrolyte is essential to achieve high energy density and power density of asymmetric supercapacitors.[19](#page-8-0)−[21](#page-8-0)

In this Article, we reported a new design of asymmetric supercapacitor based on graphene hydrogel (GH) with 3D interconnected pores and a hierarchical composite of vertically aligned  $MnO_2$  nanoplates on nickel foam  $(MnO_2-NF)$  as negative and positive electrodes, respectively (Scheme [1\)](#page-1-0). Carbon materials, exhibiting complementary electrochemical windows to various pseudocapacitive materials of transition metal oxides and conducting polymers, are most widely used as negative electrodes in asymmetric supercapacitors.<sup>[22](#page-8-0),[23](#page-8-0)</sup> Graphene consisting of hexagonally bonded  $sp<sup>2</sup>$  carbon atoms is actively investigated for supercapacitor applications due to its high specific surface area, excellent electrical conductivity and chemical stability.[24](#page-8-0),[25](#page-8-0) However, the aggregation and restacking of graphene nanosheets during processing leads to significantly reduced surface areas and therefore becomes a serious obstacle to take the full advantage of the structural characteristics of graphene. Our results have shown that assembling graphene nanosheets into GH with a 3D network structure during the chemical reduction of graphene oxides (GO) can effectively prevent the aggregation of graphene nanosheets. Consequently, GH as electrode materials provides large active surface areas,

```
Received: March 13, 2012
Accepted: April 30, 2012
Published: April 30, 2012
```
<span id="page-1-0"></span>Scheme 1. Schematic Illustration of the Fabrication Process of an Asymmetric Supercapacitor Based on GH as the Negative Electrode and  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  as the Positive Electrode



facilitates electrolyte ion transportation, and demonstrates an enhanced energy storage capacity and a good rate capability. One interesting finding is that an eco-friendly reagent of Lglutathione allows for one to produce robust GH from GO dispersion under mild conditions, offering greater flexibility than the time-consuming hydrothermal method previously reported.<sup>[26,27](#page-8-0)</sup>

 $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  with pseudocapacitance is a highly attractive positive electrode material, benefiting from its low cost, abundance, and remarkable electrochemical performance in aqueous electrolytes.[28](#page-8-0)−[30](#page-8-0) Varieties of wet-chemical and electrochemical methods have been developed to prepare nanostructured MnO2. [31](#page-8-0) Structural parameters, such as crystal type, morphology, and porosity, are the vital factors determining the electrochemical performance of  $MnO_2$ -based electrodes.<sup>[32](#page-8-0)</sup> In this work, a hierarchical composite of  $MnO_2$ -NF was prepared by electrodeposition of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates on highly conductive porous nickel foam through cathodic electrodeposition and directly used as electrodes for supercapacitors without further processing. Importantly, the porous structure of nickel foam allows a higher mass loading of active materials per area, facilitates the electrolyte ion transportation and reaction with the active materials, and eventually leads to improved utilization efficiency of active materials. Compared with anodic deposition in which a positive potential is applied to oxidize starting  ${\rm Mn}^{2+}$ into  $Mn^{4+}$  and deposit as  $MnO<sub>2</sub>^{33,34}$  $MnO<sub>2</sub>^{33,34}$  $MnO<sub>2</sub>^{33,34}$  cathodic deposition of MnO2 can avoid the oxidation and dissolution of low-cost metallic current collectors.[35,36](#page-8-0) Moreover, a robust contact endowed by electrodeposition is formed between  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ nanostructures and the highly conductive nickel foam, which can cope with the problems of poor electrical conductivity and rate capability of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  when used as electrode materials. Collectively, taking advantages of GH with 3D interconnected pores, vertically aligned  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates with sufficient free spaces, and robust contact between  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  and nickel foam, we have found that the fabricated asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  can be cycled reversibly in a wide potential window of 0−2.0 V and exhibits a much higher energy density of 23.2 Wh kg<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> than that of the symmetric supercapacitors of GH//GH (5.5 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup>) and  $MnO_2NF/MnO_2NF$  (6.7 Wh  $\text{kg}^{-1}$ ) at a current density of 1 A  $\text{g}^{-1}$ . Furthermore, the asymmetric supercapacitor displays remarkable cycling stability

with capacitance retention of 83.4% after 5000 continuous charge/discharge cycles.

## 2. EXPERIMENTAL SECTION

2.1. Preparation of Samples. GO were synthesized from graphite powder (Sigma-Aldrich) according to the modified Hummers' method.<sup>[37,38](#page-8-0)</sup> GH was prepared by the following procedure using Lglutathione as the reducing agent. Briefly, GO aqueous dispersion (2.0 mg mL<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> ) was loaded in a glass vial. Then, L-glutathione was added to get a concentration of 4.0 mg mL<sup>-1</sup>. After stirring for 60 min to dissolve the L-glutathione, the as-prepared dispersion was heated at 95 °C for 3 h without any disturbance to produce GH. The dispersion of reduced GO (RGO) was also prepared using L-glutathione as a reducing agent at the same temperature under continuous stirring. After the chemical reduction, the excess L-glutathione was removed by dialysis.

 $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  was prepared by electrodeposition of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  on nickel foam  $(1 \text{ cm} \times 1 \text{ cm})$  which was first cleaned by ethanol and deionized water. Platinum wire and saturated calomel electrode (SCE) were used as the counter and reference electrodes, respectively. The cathodic electrodeposition of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplate arrays was carried out in aqueous solution containing 0.1 M manganese acetate and 0.1 M sodium sulfate according to a method previously reported with some modification.<sup>[39](#page-8-0)</sup> The electrodeposition of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  on nickel foam was carried out at a constant potential of −1.6 V for different periods of time from 50 to 200 s to control the amount of the  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  deposited. After deposition, the nickel foam was rinsed in deionized water for several times and then dried at ambient temperature. The accurate weight of electrodeposited  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  was determined by a high-precision balance with sensitivity of 0.01 mg (Denver Instrument).

The obtained GH cylinder was freeze-dried, cut into pieces, and directly used as electrode to fabricate symmetric supercapacitor of GH//GH. MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF was also directly used to fabricate symmetric supercapacitor of  $MnO_2-NF//MnO_2-NF$ . To construct the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO_2-NF$ , the loading mass ratio of active materials  $(GH: MnO<sub>2</sub>)$  was estimated to be 1.2 according to the specific capacitance calculated from their symmetric supercapacitors, and each electrode contained about 1.0 mg of active material. The two electrodes were separated by a glass-fiber separator and assembled in a Swagelok-type cell. Aqueous  $\text{Na}_2\text{SO}_4$  solution (0.5 M) was used as the electrolyte. The specific capacitance of a supercapacitor cell  $(C_t)$  was calculated using the equations  $C_t = I \Delta t / m \Delta V$ , where I is the constant discharge current,  $\Delta t$  is the discharging time, m is the total mass of active materials in both electrodes, and  $\Delta V$  is the voltage drop upon discharging (excluding IR drop). In symmetric supercapacitors, the specific capacitance  $(C_{sc})$  of the electrode (GH or  $MnO_2$ -NF) was calculated following the equations  $C_{sc} = 4C_{t}$ . The energy density  $(E)$ 

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Figure 1. (A) AFM images of GO dispersion spin-coated on silicon wafer. (B) Photograph of aqueous mixture of GO and L-glutathione at different reaction times of 0, 30, 60, and 180 min (from left to right). (C) High resolution XPS spectra of C 1s for GO and GH. (D and E) SEM images of freeze-dried GH at low and high magnification. (F) SEM images of freeze-dried RGO.

and power density  $(P)$  of a supercapacitor cell in the Ragone plots were calculated using the equations of  $E = C_t \Delta V^2 / 2$  and  $P = E / \Delta t$ , respectively.<sup>[40,41](#page-8-0)</sup>

2.2. Materials Characterization. The microstructures of the materials were examined by field-emission scanning electron microscopy (SEM) (JSM-6701F, JEOL) and atomic force microscopy (AFM) (MFP3D microscope, Asylum Research). SEM was equipped to perform elemental analysis by energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS). The AFM samples were prepared by spin-coating the GO dispersion on silicon wafer with a  $300 \text{ nm}$  SiO<sub>2</sub> top layer and characterized with a silicon cantilever operating in tapping mode. Fourier transform infrared (FT-IR) spectra were obtained on a Perkin-Elmer Spectrum One Spectrometer. Raman spectra were acquired with a micro-Raman spectrometer (Reinshaw Raman Scope RM3000) at room temperature in the backscattering configuration with wavelength of 633 nm (1.96 eV). X-ray diffraction (XRD) patterns were collected with a Bruker AXS D8 X-ray diffractometer equipped with monochromatized Cu K $\alpha$  radiation ( $\lambda = 1.54056$  Å, 40 kV, and 20 mA). X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) was performed on a Kratos-Axis spectrometer with monochromatic Al K $\alpha$  (h $\nu$  = 1486.71) eV) X-ray radiation (15 kV and 10 mA) and a hemispherical electron energy analyzer. All XPS spectra were corrected according to the C 1s line at 284.6 eV. Curve fitting and background subtraction were accomplished using Casa XPS software. Quantachrome Autosorb 6B system was used to characterize the specific surface areas and pore structures of the electrode materials using nitrogen sorption under 77.4 K. The specific surface areas and pore size distributions of the electrode materials were calculated by Brunauer−Emmett−Teller (BET) and Barrett−Joyner−Halenda (BJH) methods, respectively. Cyclic voltammetry (CV), galvanostatic charge/discharge, and electrochemical impedance testes of supercapacitors were carried out on a CHI 660D electrochemical workstation.

# 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1. Negative Electrode Materials. Homogenous GO solution, synthesized from graphite powder according to the modified Hummers' method, was deposited on silicon wafer by spin-coating for AFM observation. As shown in Figure 1A, GO nanosheets are flat with a typical thickness of about 1.0 nm, indicating the complete exfoliation of graphite oxide into singlelayered GO nanosheets.[38](#page-8-0) L-Glutathione, an efficient, low-cost,



Figure 2. FT-IR spectra (A), XRD patterns (B), and Raman spectra (C) of GO (a) and GH (b).

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Figure 3. Electrochemical performance of the symmetric supercapacitor of GH//GH. (A) Cyclic voltammograms at different scan rates of 10, 20, 40, 60, 80, and 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup> (from inner to outer). (B) Galvanostatic charge/discharge curves at different current densities of 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, and 10 A g<sup>-1</sup>. . (C) Capacitance retention ratio as a function of discharge current densities. (D) Galvanostatic charge/discharge curves of symmetric supercapacitors of GH//GH (a) and RGO//RGO (b) at current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$ . .



Figure 4. (A) Photographs of nickel foam before (left) and after (right) electrodeposition of MnO<sub>2</sub>. (B and C) SEM images of bare nickel foam with low and high magnification. (D, E and F) SEM images of MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoplates electrodeposited on nickel foam at −1.6 V for 100 s with different magnifications.

and eco-friendly reducing agent, was selected for the chemical reduction of GO. Stable dispersion of graphene was obtained previously when a low concentration  $(0.1 \;{\rm mg\;mL^{-1}})$  of GO was reduced with L-glutathione under continuous stirring.<sup>[42](#page-8-0)</sup> In this Article, we found that the use of concentrated GO dispersion (2.0 mg mL<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> ) and the elimination of physical disturbance are essential for the self-assembly of graphene nanosheets into 3D

structures of GH in this reaction system. A series of GO and Lglutathione dispersion was reacted at 95 °C for different time spans to investigate the gelation process (Figure [1B](#page-2-0)). Before the chemical reduction, GO was well dispersed in water forming a stable dark-brown colloidal suspension. After the addition of L-glutathione, gelation could not take place if the reaction time was less than 30 min. Further prolonging the

<span id="page-4-0"></span>

Figure 5. (A) EDS spectra of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$ . (B) High resolution XPS spectra of  $\text{MnO}_2$ -NF for Mn 2p<sub>1/2</sub> and Mn 2p<sub>3/2</sub>. (C) XRD pattern of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$ .

reaction time to 60 min, a black cylinder of GH was obtained. After being treated for 180 min, the apparent size of the black cylinder decreased, and little change was observed subsequently.

The formation of 3D structured GH is attributed to the partial overlapping or coalescing of flexible reduced GO nanosheets via supramolecular interactions such as  $\pi-\pi$ stacking and hydrogen bonding.<sup>[43](#page-8-0),[44](#page-8-0)</sup> Reduction degree is also an important factor contributing to the formation of GH.<sup>[27](#page-8-0)</sup> As the reduction proceeded, the graphene nanosheets assembled more tightly to form GH with 3D interconnected network structures (Figure S1, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0). The welldefined and interconnected 3D network of the resulting GH was revealed by typical SEM images (Figure [1](#page-2-0)D,E) of its freezedried sample. Plenty of pores with a wide size distribution are observed, and the solid walls of these pores are composed by randomly cross-linked and intertwisted graphene nanosheets. The BET specific surface areas of GH after reduction of 30, 60, and 180 min were measured to be 230.4, 259.8, and 315.2  $m<sup>2</sup>$ g<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> , respectively (Figure S2, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0). Most pores of GH prepared at different times are in the mesoporous range with peaks centered at 2−10 nm. The increase of BET specific surface areas with the prolonged reaction time indicates the formation of 3D network of GH can effectively prevent the agglomeration and restacking of graphene sheets. The wellpreserved 3D structure of GH can also greatly shorten the diffusion and migration paths of electrolyte ions during the rapid charge/discharge process. In addition, this unique 3D structure of GH enables the fabrication of self-supported supercapacitor electrodes, which is beneficial for improving the overall energy density of the supercapacitor by avoiding the utilization of conducting additives and polymer binders.<sup>[45](#page-8-0)</sup> For comparison, a common strategy was employed to prepare the dispersion of reduced GO (RGO) using L-glutathione as a reducing agent but under continuous stirring. After filtration and freeze-drying, serious aggregation was observed due to the strong interactions between RGO nanosheets (Figure [1](#page-2-0)F), and the BET specific surface area of RGO is 210.9 m<sup>2</sup> g<sup>-1</sup>, , significantly smaller than that of GH (315.2  $m^2$  g<sup>-1</sup>) (Figure S2, [Supporting Information](#page-8-0)).

The successful reduction of GO by L-glutathione was confirmed by high resolution XPS spectra of C1s and FT-IR spectra. As shown in Figures [1C](#page-2-0) and [2A](#page-2-0), the peaks of oxygen functionalities decreased significantly after the chemical reduction for 180 min, revealing that most of the oxygen functional groups on GO were removed. A two-step  $S_N^2$ nucleophilic reaction is the possible mechanism for the chemical reduction of GO by L-glutathione (Figure S3, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0).<sup>[46](#page-8-0)</sup> The thiol group in L-glutathione is susceptible to oxidation and ready to release a proton, functioning as a nucleophile with high binding affinity to oxygen containing groups, such as hydroxyl and epoxide groups on GO to form water molecules.<sup>[47](#page-8-0)</sup> Eventually, L-glutathione is oxidized into glutathione disulfide leading to the formation of RGO nanosheets. In the FT-IR spectra (Figure [2](#page-2-0)A), the characteristic stretching vibration peaks of C−S bonds in the range of 710−580 cm<sup>-1</sup> were not detectable,<sup>[48](#page-8-0)</sup> and no peaks from sulfur are observed in the EDS spectra of GH (Figure S4, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0). These results support the proposed reaction mechanism and also suggest the excess L-glutathione and glutathione disulfide were successfully removed by dialysis.

The structure of GO and GH was also studied by X-ray diffraction (XRD). According to the XRD patterns (Figure [2B](#page-2-0)), GO has a large interlayer distance of 0.85 nm ( $2\theta = 10.3^{\circ}$ ) due to the presence of hydroxyl, epoxy, and carboxyl groups. After chemical reduction for 180 min, a broad peak centered at  $2\theta =$ 24.4° corresponding to an interlayer distance of 0.37 nm emerged, suggesting the poor ordering of graphene sheets along their stacking direction in GH.<sup>[49](#page-8-0)</sup> The change of structure after the reduction process is further reflected in the Raman spectra of GO and GH (Figure [2C](#page-2-0)). Both of the spectra of GO and GH display the existence of D and G bonds located at 1352 and 1594  $\text{cm}^{-1}$ . The intensity ratio  $(I_{\text{D}}/I_{\text{G}})$  of D and G bands is 0.8 in GO and increases to 1.2 in GH, demonstrating that the chemical reduction altered the structure of GO and introduced a large number of structural defects. $50,51$ 

The electrical conductivity of GH was measured to be ∼2 S m<sup>-1</sup> based on a two-probe method.<sup>[26](#page-8-0)</sup> This remarkable conductivity and its mechanical stability enable GH to be directly used as electrodes to fabricate supercapacitors without the need of polymer binder and conducting additives.<sup>[8](#page-8-0)</sup> The performance of the symmetric supercapacitor of GH//GH was tested by cyclic voltammetry (CV) and galvanostatic charge/ discharge in aqueous  $Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$  electrolyte. The nearly rectangular CV curves manifest the ideal capacitive behavior of the supercapacitor (Figure [3A](#page-3-0)). Even at a high scan rate of 100 mV s<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> , the shapes of CV curves remain undistorted, implying low contact resistance in the supercapacitor. The

<span id="page-5-0"></span>

Figure 6. Electrochemical performance of the symmetric supercapacitor of  $MnO_2NF/MnO_2NF$ . (A) Cyclic voltammograms at different scan rates of 10, 20, 40, 60, 80, and 100 mV s<sup>-1</sup> (from inner to outer). (B) Galvanostatic charge/discharge curves at different current densities of 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, and 10 A g<sup>−1</sup>. (C) Galvanostatic charge/discharge curves at a constant current density of 2 A g<sup>−1</sup>. (D) Capacitance retention ratio as a function of discharge currents.

galvanostatic charge/discharge curves of the supercapacitor are linear and symmetric in the total range of potential (Figure [3B](#page-3-0)). From the slope of galvanostatic charge/discharge curves, the specific capacitance  $(C_{sc})$  of GH is calculated to be 157.7 F g<sup>-1</sup> at a current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$ . When the current density increases to 10 A  $g^{-1}$ , the specific capacitance is 92.0 F  $g^{-1}$ , maintaining 58.3% of that at the current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$ (Figure [3](#page-3-0)C). The high-rate capability is possibly due to the 3D porous structure and improved conductivity of the Lglutathione reduced GH. The aggregated RGO was mixed with carbon black as the conducting agent and PVDF as the binder in a mass ratio of 8:1:1 to fabricate a symmetric supercapacitor of RGO//RGO. The aggregation of graphene nanosheets lead to reduced active sites for electrolyte ions, and consequently, in comparison with GH, RGO exhibits a much lower specific capacitance of 114.5 F  $g^{-1}$  at a current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$  (Figure [3](#page-3-0)D).

3.2. Positive Electrode Materials. Nickel foam, with excellent electrical conductivity, is featured of cross-linked grids, providing higher porosity and surface area than conventional metal plates (Figure  $4A,B$ ).<sup>[52](#page-9-0),[53](#page-9-0)</sup> After electrodeposition in aqueous solution of manganese acetate at  $-1.6$  V, the smooth surface of the nickel foam skeleton (Figure [4](#page-3-0)C) became decorated with a dark brown thin film of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  (Figure [4A](#page-3-0)). The deposited  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  with nanoplate structure is uniformly coated on the grid of nickel foam and builds up an interconnected network with highly porous structures (Figure [4](#page-3-0)D,E,F). The formation of nanoplate structure is probably due to the generation of  $H_2$  bubbles at the negative enough potential (−1.6 V), which function as dynamic templates for the electrodeposition.<sup>[54](#page-9-0),[55](#page-9-0)</sup> Importantly, the hierarchical structure of  $MnO_2$ -NF is beneficial for improved electrochemical

performance of the active materials, because it would lead to fast ion/electron transfer and sufficient contact between active materials and electrolytes. The unique network structure constituted of vertically aligned  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates can also provide necessary free spaces between the individual nanostructures to relax the volume change during continuous charge/discharge reactions.

EDS measurement confirms the presence of the elements of manganese and oxygen in the deposited materials, whereas no other chemical elements, such as sodium and sulfur present in the salt precursors, were detectable (Figure [5A](#page-4-0)). XPS was conducted for a better understanding of the chemical composition of the cathodic-deposited material. The Mn  $2p_{3/2}$  peak is at 641.9 eV, and the Mn  $2p_{1/2}$  peak centers at 653.4 eV, with a spin-energy separation of 11.5 eV (Figure [5B](#page-4-0)). These results are in accordance with the reported data of Mn  $2p_{3/2}$  and Mn  $2p_{1/2}$  in MnO<sub>2</sub>.<sup>[56](#page-9-0)</sup> The XRD pattern of MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF exhibits the diffraction peaks from nickel substrate and several broad peaks with low intensity, which can be assigned to  $\varepsilon$ - $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  (Figure [5C](#page-4-0)).<sup>[57](#page-9-0)</sup> The formation of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  is probably the result of a sequential process that involves electrolysis of water and electrochemical reduction of  $O_2$  which leads to increased local pH, precipitation of  $Mn(OH)_{2}$ , and finally oxidation of  $\text{Mn}(\text{OH})_2$  in air to form  $\text{MnO}_2$ .<sup>[58](#page-9-0)</sup>

 $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  can also be directly used to fabricate supercapacitors by eliminating the need of polymer binders and conducting additives. The specific capacitance was found to be dependent on the amount and morphology of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  on nickel foam. With the electrodeposition time increasing from 50 to 200 s,  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  with multilayered structures evolved from monolayer nanoplates (Figure S5, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0), the weight of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  increased from 0.6 to 1.7 mg, and its



Figure 7. (A) Comparative cyclic voltammograms of GH (a) and  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  (b) electrodes in a three-electrode system at a scan rate of 20 mV s<sup>-1</sup>. (B) Cyclic voltammograms of the asymmetric supercapacitor of GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF measured at different potential windows at a scan rate of 20 mV  $s^{-1}$ . .

specific capacitance ( $C_{\rm sc}$ ) decreased from 266.8 to 110.8 F g<sup>-1</sup> at the current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$  (Figure S6, [Supporting](#page-8-0) [Information\)](#page-8-0). The formation of thick nanoplates could reduce the specific surface area of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  exposed to electrolyte ions and result in the decrease of the specific capacitance. Taking into account the mass and specific capacitance of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ , the electrodeposition time was fixed at 100 s for further investigations. The specific capacitance of  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  deposited for 100 s is 194.6 F  $g^{-1}$  at the current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$ . The obtained MnO<sub>2</sub> nanoplates exhibit a large BET specific surface area of 59.0 m<sup>2</sup> g<sup>-1</sup> with a pore size distribution in the range of 2−10 nm (Figure S7, [Supporting Information\)](#page-8-0). Figure [6](#page-5-0)A shows the CV and galvanostatic charge/discharge curves of the symmetric supercapacitor of  $MnO_2-NF//MnO_2-NF$  in aqueous Na2SO4 electrolyte. The typical rectangular shape of all CV curves measured at different scan rates indicates the perfect capacitive behavior of the supercapacitor (Figure [6A](#page-5-0)). The galvanostatic charge/discharge curves are very symmetrical in the total range of potential, and the slope of every curve is potential independent with a constant value at a specified current density (Figure [6](#page-5-0)B,C). Resulting from the unique hierarchical structure of  $MnO_2$ -NF and the robust contact between  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates and nickel foam endowed by the electrodeposition method, the supercapacitor possesses superior rate capability. When the current density increased to 10 A g<sup>-1</sup>, the specific capacitance still reached 120.0 F g<sup>-1</sup>, about 62% of that at 1 A  $g^{-1}$  (Figure [6](#page-5-0)D).

3.3. Asymmetric Hybrid Supercapacitor. An asymmetric supercapacitor was fabricated using  $MnO_2$ -NF and GH as the

positive and negative electrodes, respectively (Scheme [1\)](#page-1-0). Cyclic voltammetry was first used to estimate the electrochemical potential windows of the electrodes in a threeelectrode system with Pt foil and saturated calomel electrode (SCE) as the counter and reference electrodes (Figure 7A). The stable potential window is between −1.0 and 0 V for GH and between 0 and 1.0 V for  $MnO_2$ -NF. The cell voltage can be expressed as the sum of the potential range of GH and  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ -NF, and consequently, it can be extended up to 2.0 V in 0.5 M aqueous  $Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$  solution for the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF<sup>59,60</sup>$  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF<sup>59,60</sup>$  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF<sup>59,60</sup>$  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF<sup>59,60</sup>$  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF<sup>59,60</sup>$  To obtain a 2.0 V operating potential window, it is necessary to balance the charges stored at the positive and negative electrodes. The stored charges  $(q)$  are related with the specific capacitance  $(C_{sc})$ , the potential window  $(\Delta V)$ , and the mass  $(m)$  of the electrode according to  $q = C_{sc} \times$  $\Delta V \times m$ .<sup>[61](#page-9-0)</sup> Therefore, on the basis of the specific capacitance values and the potential windows of the two materials, the mass ratio between GH and MnO<sub>2</sub> of  $m(GH)/m(MnO<sub>2</sub>) = 1.2$  was selected in the asymmetric supercapacitor cell, and indeed, the fabricated asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO_2-NF$ exhibits a stable potential window up to 2.0 V (Figure 7B). Because the energy density is proportional to the square of the potential, the enlarged potential window gives rise to a remarkably enhanced energy density of supercapacitors. Accordingly, the potential window of 0−2.0 V was chosen for further investigation of the overall electrochemical performance of the asymmetric supercapacitor.

The asymmetric supercapacitor shows relatively rectangular CV curves at scan rates up to 100 mV  $s^{-1}$ , indicating a nearly ideal supercapacitor behavior and a desirable fast charge/ discharge property (Figure [8A](#page-7-0)). Galvanostatic charge/discharge tests were also performed with different current densities in a potential window of 0−2.0 V (Figure [8B](#page-7-0)). The symmetric charge/discharge curves and the linear potential-time profile in the whole potential range also demonstrate a good capacitive behavior with a rapid I−V response of our asymmetric supercapacitor. From the slope of the discharge curve, the specific capacitance  $(C_t)$  of the asymmetric supercapacitor is calculated to be 41.7 F  $g^{-1}$  based on the total mass of active materials in the two electrodes at a current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$ and still reaches 26.8 F g<sup>-1</sup> at a high current density of 10 A g<sup>-1</sup> (Figure [8](#page-7-0)C). Ragone plots, depicting the relationship of power densities  $(P)$  and energy densities  $(E)$ , were further used to evaluate the performance of the three types of supercapacitors (Figure [8](#page-7-0)D). The energy density of the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO_2NF$  with a cell voltage of 2.0 V is much higher than that of the symmetric supercapacitors of  $MnO_2-NF//MnO_2-NF$  and  $GH//GH$  with a cell voltage of 1.0 V at the same power density. Specifically, compared with the symmetric supercapacitors of  $MnO_2-NF//MnO_2-NF$  (6.7 Wh  $\rm kg^{-1})$  and GH//GH (5.5 Wh  $\rm kg^{-1})$ , an about 3-fold increase of energy density is obtained for the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH/MnO_2NF (23.2 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup>)$  at a current density of  $1 Ag<sup>-1</sup>$ . More importantly, the asymmetric supercapacitor can provide a high energy density without sacrificing power density. When the power density increases to 10.0 kW kg<sup>-1</sup>, the energy density of  $\rm GH//MnO_2-NF$  still reaches 14.9 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup> at current density of 10 A  $g^{-1}$ . The maximum energy density obtained for the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO_2-NF$  at a current density of 1 A  $g^{-1}$  is comparable or higher than those of MnO<sub>2</sub>based asymmetric supercapacitors with aqueous electrolyte solutions, such as  $\text{PEDOT}/\text{/MnO}_2$  (13.5 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup>, at a current density of 0.25 A  $g^{-1}$ ),<sup>[62](#page-9-0)</sup> FeOOH//MnO<sub>2</sub> (24 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup>, at a

<span id="page-7-0"></span>

Figure 8. Electrochemical performance of the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH/MnO_2NF$ . (A) Cyclic voltammograms at different scan rates of 10, 20, 40, 60, 80, and 100 mV s<sup>−</sup><sup>1</sup> (from inner to outer). (B) Galvanostatic charge/discharge curves at different current densities of 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, and 10 A g<sup>-1</sup>. (C) Capacitance retention ratio as a function of discharge currents. (D) Ragone plots of the asymmetric supercapacitor of GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF (a) and symmetric supercapacitors of  $MnO_2-NF/MnO_2-NF$  (b) and  $GH//GH$  (c).



Figure 9. Cycle performance of the asymmetric supercapacitor of  $GH//MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF. (A) Capacitance retention ratio as a function of cycle$ numbers. (B) Nyquist plots in the frequency range of 0.1 Hz to 10 kHz before (a) and after (b) 5000 cycles, and the electrical equivalent circuit used for fitting impedance spectra.

current density of 0.5 A  $g^{-1}$ ),<sup>[63](#page-9-0)</sup> activated carbon//MnO<sub>2</sub> (17.3 Wh  $kg^{-1}$ , at a current density of 0.55 A  $g^{-1}$ ),<sup>[64](#page-9-0)</sup> activated carbon//NaMnO<sub>2</sub> (19.5 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup>, at a current density of ~0.04  $A g^{-1}$ ),<sup>[65](#page-9-0)</sup> activated carbon//mesoporous MnO<sub>2</sub> (10.4 Wh kg<sup>-1</sup> , at a current density of ~0.3 A  $g^{-1}$ ),<sup>[66](#page-9-0)</sup> and activated carbon//  $K_{0.27}MnO_2 \cdot 0.6H_2O$  (25.3 Wh  $kg^{-1}$ , at a current density of  $\sim$ 0.06 A g<sup>-1</sup>).<sup>[67](#page-9-0)</sup>

In addition, our asymmetric supercapacitor exhibited excellent cycling stability, which is one of the most important requirements in practical applications. The cycling test of our device shows capacitance retention of 83.4% over 5000 cycles (Figure 9A). Although occasional cracks were observed in  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  electrode after the cycling test,  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  was still uniformly coated on the branches of nickel foam and maintained its nanoplate structure (Figure S8, [Supporting](#page-8-0) [Information\)](#page-8-0). Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) was used to investigate the resistance change of the asymmetric supercapacitor before and after the cycle tests. Nyquist plots were analyzed by the software of ZSimpWin on the basis of the equivalent circuit (Figure 9B). In the low-frequency region, the impedance plot increases sharply and tends to become vertical lines, which are the characteristics of pure capacitive behavior. At the high frequencies, the intercept at real axis  $(Z')$  represents the combined resistance  $(R_s)$  including ionic resistance of electrolyte, intrinsic resistance of substrate, and contact resistance at the interface of active material/current collector. The semicircle represents the charge transfer resistance  $(R<sub>ct</sub>)$  at the electrode/electrolyte interface.<sup>[68](#page-9-0)</sup> After 5000 cycles, nearly no change was observed for R<sub>s</sub> (4.9 Ω), and only a slight increase of  $R_{\rm ct}$  from 2.0 to 3.7  $\Omega$  was observed. These EIS

# <span id="page-8-0"></span>ACS Applied Materials & Interfaces **Research Article** Research Article **Research Article**

results further demonstrate the exceptional stability of the asymmetric supercapacitor.

# 4. CONCLUSIONS

GH with 3D interconnected pores was successfully prepared by reducing GO with an eco-friendly reagent of L-glutathione under mild conditions. Vertically aligned  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates were uniformly deposited on porous nickel foam under cathodic conditions. Asymmetric supercapacitor was fabricated using these two materials as negative and positive electrodes, respectively. Benefitting from 3D GH with well-preserved graphene nanosheets, vertically aligned  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  nanoplates with sufficient free spaces, and the robust contact between  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ and nickel foam, the asymmetric supercapacitor of GH//  $MnO<sub>2</sub>-NF$  exhibits stable cycling performance and remarkable energy density of 23.2 Wh  $kg^{-1}$ . Such asymmetric supercapacitor offers great promise in the application of highperformance energy storage systems because of its advantages of low-cost, facile fabrication process, high energy and power density, and eco-friendly nature.

# ■ ASSOCIATED CONTENT

#### **S** Supporting Information

Supplementary figures. This material is available free of charge via the Internet at [http://pubs.acs.org.](http://pubs.acs.org)

# **E** AUTHOR INFORMATION

#### Corresponding Author

\*E-mail: [hduan@ntu.edu.sg.](mailto:hduan@ntu.edu.sg)

# **Notes**

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

### **■ ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

H.D. thanks the program of Nanyang Assistant Professorship for financial support. H.G. is a recipient of graduate research scholarship supported by Nanyang Technological University, Singapore.

#### ■ REFERENCES

(1) Hall, P. J.; Mirzaeian, M.; Fletcher, S. I.; Sillars, F. B.; Rennie, A. J. R.; Shitta-Bey, G. O.; Wilson, G.; Cruden, A.; Carter, R. Energy Environ. Sci. 2010, 3, 1238−1251.

- (2) Simon, P.; Gogotsi, Y. Nat. Mater. 2008, 7, 845−854.
- (3) Kotz, R.; Carlen, M. Electrochim. Acta 2000, 45, 2483−2498.
- (4) Frackowiak, E. Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 2007, 9, 1774−1785.
- (5) Lee, S. W.; Gallant, B. M.; Byon, H. R.; Hammond, P. T.; Shao-Horn, Y. Energy Environ. Sci. 2011, 4, 1972−1985.
- (6) Zhang, L. L.; Zhou, R.; Zhao, X. S. J. Mater. Chem. 2010, 20, 5983−5992.
- (7) Du, F.; Yu, D. S.; Dai, L. M.; Ganguli, S.; Varshney, V.; Roy, A. K. Chem. Mater. 2011, 23, 4810−4816.
- (8) Sun, Y. Q.; Wu, Q.; Shi, G. Q. Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 2011, 13, 17249−17254.
- (9) Stoller, M. D.; Park, S. J.; Zhu, Y. W.; An, J. H.; Ruoff, R. S. Nano Lett. 2008, 8, 3498−3502.
- (10) Chen, Y.; Zhang, X. O.; Zhang, D. C.; Yu, P.; Ma, Y. W. Carbon 2011, 49, 573−580.
- (11) Vivekchand, S. R. C.; Rout, C. S.; Subrahmanyam, K. S.; Govindaraj, A.; Rao, C. N. R. J. Chem. Sci. 2008, 120, 9−13.
- (12) Wang, Y. G.; Xia, Y. Y. Electrochem. Commun. 2005, 7, 1138− 1142.
- (13) Zhao, X.; Sanchez, B. M.; Dobson, P. J.; Grant, P. S. Nanoscale 2011, 3, 839−855.
- (14) Demarconnay, L.; Raymundo-Pinero, E.; Beguin, F. J. Power Sources 2011, 196, 580−586.
- (15) Conway, B. E.; Pell, W. G. J. Solid State Electrochem. 2003, 7, 637−644.
- (16) Pell, W. G.; Conway, B. E. J. Power Sources 2004, 136, 334−345.
- (17) Long, J. W.; Belanger, D.; Brousse, T.; Sugimoto, W.; Sassin, M. B.; Crosnier, O. MRS Bull. 2011, 36, 513−522.
- (18) Wang, G. P.; Zhang, L.; Zhang, J. J. Chem. Soc. Rev. 2012, 41, 797−828.
- (19) Chen, P. C.; Shen, G. Z.; Shi, Y.; Chen, H. T.; Zhou, C. W. ACS Nano 2010, 4, 4403−4411.
- (20) Zhang, J. T.; Jiang, J. W.; Li, H. L.; Zhao, X. S. Energy Environ. Sci 2011, 4, 4009−4015.
- (21) Yu, G. H.; Hu, L. B.; Vosgueritchian, M.; Wang, H. L.; Xie, X.; McDonough, J. R.; Cui, X.; Cui, Y.; Bao, Z. N. Nano Lett. 2011, 11, 2905−2911.
- (22) Brousse, T.; Toupin, M.; Belanger, D. J. Electrochem. Soc. 2004, 151, A614−A622.
- (23) Jiang, H.; Li, C. Z.; Sun, T.; Ma, J. Nanoscale 2012, 4, 807−812. (24) Wang, Y.; Shi, Z. Q.; Huang, Y.; Ma, Y. F.; Wang, C. Y.; Chen,
- M. M.; Chen, Y. S. J. Phys. Chem. C 2009, 113, 13103−13107.
- (25) Mishra, A. K.; Ramaprabhu, S. J. Phys. Chem. C 2011, 115, 14006−14013.
- (26) Xu, Y. X.; Sheng, K. X.; Li, C.; Shi, G. Q. ACS Nano 2010, 4, 4324−4330.
- (27) Sheng, K. X.; Xu, Y. X.; Li, C.; Shi, G. Q. New Carbon Mater. 2011, 26, 9−15.
- (28) Qu, Q. T.; Zhang, P.; Wang, B.; Chen, Y. H.; Tian, S.; Wu, Y. P.; Holze, R. J. Phys. Chem. C 2009, 113, 14020−14027.
- (29) Hu, L. B.; Chen, W.; Xie, X.; Liu, N. A.; Yang, Y.; Wu, H.; Yao,
- Y.; Pasta, M.; Alshareef, H. N.; Cui, Y. ACS Nano 2011, 5, 8904−8913. (30) Ghodbane, O.; Pascal, J. L.; Favier, F. ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces 2009, 1, 1130−1139.
- (31) Chou, S. L.; Wang, J. Z.; Chew, S. Y.; Liu, H. K.; Dou, S. X. Electrochem. Commun. 2008, 10, 1724−1727.
- (32) Wei, W. F.; Cui, X. W.; Chen, W. X.; Ivey, D. G. Chem. Soc. Rev. 2011, 40, 1697−1721.
- (33) Wu, M. S.; Chiang, P. C. J. Electrochem. Solid State Lett. 2004, 7, A123−A126.
- (34) Wei, W. F.; Cui, X. W.; Mao, X. H.; Chen, W. X.; Ivey, D. G. Electrochim. Acta 2011, 56, 1619−1628.
- (35) Zhao, D. D.; Yang, Z.; Zhang, L. Y.; Feng, X. L.; Zhang, Y. F. Electrochem. Solid State Lett. 2011, 14, A93−A96.
- (36) Wang, Y. H.; Zhitomirsky, I. Mater. Lett. 2011, 65, 1759−1761.
- (37) Hummers, W. S.; Offeman, R. E. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1958, 80, 1339−1339.
- (38) Gao, H. C.; Xiao, F.; Ching, C. B.; Duan, H. W. ACS Appl. Mater. Interfaces 2011, 3, 3049−3057.
- (39) Liu, D. W.; Zhang, Q. F.; Xiao, P.; Garcia, B. B.; Guo, Q.; Champion, R.; Cao, G. Z. Chem. Mater. 2008, 20, 1376−1380.
- (40) Stoller, M. D.; Ruoff, R. S. Energy Environ. Sci. 2010, 3, 1294− 1301.
- (41) Zhang, L.; Shi, G. Q. J. Phys. Chem. C 2011, 115, 17206−17212.
- (42) Pham, T. A.; Kim, J. S.; Kim, J. S.; Jeong, Y. T. Colloid Surf., A: Physicochem. Eng. Aspects 2011, 384, 543−548.
- (43) Chen, W. F.; Yan, L. F. Nanoscale 2011, 3, 3132−3137.
- (44) Bai, H.; Li, C.; Wang, X. L.; Shi, G. Q. J. Phys. Chem. C 2011, 115, 5545−5551.
- (45) Zhang, X. T.; Sui, Z. Y.; Xu, B.; Yue, S. F.; Luo, Y. J.; Zhan, W. C.; Liu, B. J. Mater. Chem. 2011, 21, 6494−6497.
- (46) Gao, J.; Liu, F.; Liu, Y. L.; Ma, N.; Wang, Z. Q.; Zhang, X. Chem. Mater. 2010, 22, 2213−2218.
- (47) Chen, D. Z.; Li, L. D.; Guo, L. Nanotechnology 2011, 22, 325601.
- (48) Kulakov, V. A.; Shishlyannikova, N. Y.; Virnik, A. D. J. Appl. Spectrosc. 1987, 46, 619−625.
- (49) Fan, Z. J.; Wang, K.; Wei, T.; Yan, J.; Song, L. P.; Shao, B. Carbon 2010, 48, 1686−1689.

# <span id="page-9-0"></span>ACS Applied Materials & Interfaces **Research Article** Research Article

- (50) Moon, I. K.; Lee, J.; Ruoff, R. S.; Lee, H. Nat. Commun. 2010, 1, 73.
- (51) Pei, S. F.; Zhao, J. P.; Du, J. H.; Ren, W. C.; Cheng, H. M. Carbon 2010, 48, 4466−4474.
- (52) Xue, L. G.; Hao, H.; Wei, Z.; Huang, T.; Yu, A. S. J. Solid State Electrochem. 2011, 15, 485−491.
- (53) Wang, Y. L.; Zhao, Y. Q.; Xu, C. L. J. Solid State Electrochem. 2012, 16, 829−834.
- (54) Xiao, W.; Xia, H.; Fuh, J. Y. H.; Lu, L. J. Electrochem. Soc. 2009, 156, A627−A633.
- (55) Liu, D. W.; Garcia, B. B.; Zhang, Q. F.; Guo, Q.; Zhang, Y. H.; Sepehri, S.; Cao, G. Z. Adv. Funct. Mater. 2009, 19, 1015−1023.
- (56) Lu, X. H.; Zheng, D. Z.; Zhai, T.; Liu, Z. Q.; Huang, Y. Y.; Xie, S. L.; Tong, Y. X. Energy Environ. Sci. 2011, 4, 2915−2921.
- (57) Kim, C. H.; Akase, Z.; Zhang, L. C.; Heuer, A. H.; Newman, A. E.; Hughes, P. J. J. Solid State Chem. 2006, 179, 753−774.
- (58) Zhu, C. Z.; Guo, S. J.; Fang, Y. X.; Han, L.; Wang, E. K.; Dong, S. J. Nano Res. 2011, 4, 648−657.
- (59) Brousse, T.; Taberna, P. L.; Crosnier, O.; Dugas, R.; Guillemet, P.; Scudeller, Y.; Zhou, Y.; Favier, F.; Belanger, D.; Simon, P. J. Power
- Sources 2007, 173, 633−641.
- (60) Khomenko, V.; Raymundo-Pinero, E.; Beguin, F. J. Power Sources 2006, 153, 183−190.
- (61) Fan, Z. J.; Yan, J.; Wei, T.; Zhi, L. J.; Ning, G. Q.; Li, T. Y.; Wei, F. Adv. Funct. Mater. 2011, 21, 2366−2375.
- (62) Khomenko, V.; Raymundo-Pinero, E.; Frackowiak, E.; Beguin, F. Appl. Phys. A: Mater. Sci. Process. 2006, 82, 567−573.
- (63) Jin, W. H.; Cao, G. T.; Sun, J. Y. J. Power Sources 2008, 175, 686−691.
- (64) Cottineau, T.; Toupin, M.; Delahaye, T.; Brousse, T.; Belanger, D. Appl. Phys. A: Mater. Sci. Process. 2006, 82, 599−606.
- (65) Qu, Q. T.; Shi, Y.; Tian, S.; Chen, Y. H.; Wu, Y. P.; Holze, R. J. Power Sources 2009, 194, 1222−1225.
- (66) Wang, Y. T.; Lu, A. H.; Zhang, H. L.; Li, W. C. J. Phys. Chem. C 2011, 115, 5413−5421.
- (67) Qu, Q. T.; Li, L.; Tian, S.; Guo, W. L.; Wu, Y. P.; Holze, R. J. Power Sources 2010, 195, 2789−2794.
- (68) Fic, K.; Lota, G.; Meller, M.; Frackowiak, E. Energy Environ. Sci. 2012, 5, 5842−5850.